

Friederike Alm

The Politics of Us and Them – The Migration
Politics Nexus

promotion 16

The dissertation prize is awarded by Verlag Barbara Budrich

Members of the jury of experts:

Prof. Dr. Jörg Blasius, Universität Bonn

Prof. Dr. Ralf Bohnsack, FU Berlin

Prof. Dr. Sabine Hering, Universität Siegen

Prof. Dr. Heinz-Hermann Krüger, Universität Halle-Wittenberg

Prof. Dr. Ilse Lenz, Ruhr-Universität Bochum

Prof. Dr. Uwe Schimank, Universität Bremen

Prof. Dr. Gary Schaal, Helmut-Schmidt-Universität Hamburg

Prof. Dr. Sigrid Tschöpe-Scheffler, TH Köln

promotion 16

Der Wettbewerb für Dissertationen ausgeschrieben
vom Verlag Barbara Budrich

Mitglieder der Fachjury:

Prof. Dr. Jörg Blasius, Universität Bonn

Prof. Dr. Ralf Bohnsack, FU Berlin

Prof. Dr. Sabine Hering, Universität Siegen

Prof. Dr. Heinz-Hermann Krüger, Universität Halle-Wittenberg

Prof. Dr. Ilse Lenz, Ruhr-Universität Bochum

Prof. Dr. Uwe Schimank, Universität Bremen

Prof. Dr. Gary Schaal, Helmut Schmidt Universität Hamburg

Prof. Dr. Sigrid Tschöpe-Scheffler, TH Köln

Friederike Alm

The Politics of Us and Them – The Migration Politics Nexus

A Comparative-Historical Analysis of Canada,
France, and Germany

Verlag Barbara Budrich
Opladen • Berlin • Toronto 2026

This book was published in Open Access with the support of the Edmund Budrich Grant 2024.

© 2026 This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 (CC-BY 4.0). It permits use, duplication, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>



The use of third-party material in this book does not indicate that it is also subject to the Creative Commons licence mentioned. If the material used is not subject to the aforementioned Creative Commons licence and the action in question is not permitted by law, the consent of the respective rights holder must be obtained for further use. Trademarks, company names, generally descriptive terms etc. used in this work may not be used freely. The rights of the respective rights holder must be observed and use is subject to the rules of trademark law, even without separate reference.

This book is available as a free download from www.budrich.eu
(<https://doi.org/10.3224/84743136>).

© 2026 by Verlag Barbara Budrich GmbH, Opladen, Berlin & Toronto
Stauffenbergstr. 7 | D-51379 Leverkusen | info@budrich.de | www.budrich.eu

ISBN 978-3-8474-3136-7 (Paperback)
eISBN 978-3-8474-3271-5 (PDF)
DOI 10.3224/84743136

Verlag Barbara Budrich GmbH
Stauffenbergstr. 7. D-51379 Leverkusen Opladen, Germany
86 Delma Drive. Toronto, ON M8W 4P6 Canada

A CIP catalogue record for this book is available from Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek (The German National Library) (<https://portal.dnb.de>)

Cover design by Bettina Lehfeldt, Kleinmachnow – www.lehfeldtgraphic.de
Cover image: www.lehfeldtmalerei.de

Für meine Eltern

Acknowledgments

I am very grateful for the support I received throughout researching and writing my PhD thesis in last five years. Here I would like to extend my heartfelt gratitude to those who supported and guided me through the process academically and emotionally (or provided much needed distraction when I needed a break).

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisors Prof. Dr. Jens Borchert of Goethe University and Prof. Dr. Elke Winter of the University of Ottawa. Jens provided invaluable support in initiating this research project, supervised the research and writing process with encouragement, patience, and critical attention to detail, and not least, gently reminded me not to take on too much on the side. He also encouraged and supported my teaching, including the design of my own syllabi in relation to the thesis subjects. Getting to teach on these subjects was among the most rewarding experiences of my PhD years. Elke was an equally encouraging supervisor, who, despite the supervision taking place across the big pond during a global pandemic, invited me to join collaborations and conferences, which broadened my academic horizons. Not least, she invited me to join a workshop in Harvard in the autumn of 2022, which was among the highlights of my PhD years.

My heartfelt gratitude goes out to all the experts in migration politics who took time out of their busy days to discuss Canadian, French, and / or German migration politics history with me. Your contributions to this project are vital and I am very grateful for each and every person who decided to participate. Thank you, merci beaucoup, vielen Dank.

Numerous colleagues helped me in the research process with insightful comments and guidance. The small group of migration politics PhD researchers which gathered to organize the migration politics colloquium ‘Migrakolloq’ met every month to provide encouragement, draft comments, and emotional support. Thank you for everything Alexandra Berger, Anna Goerg, and Marlene Neumann. To my colleague and friend Julia Dupont, thank you for your input on the project and your camaraderie. To my colleague Brigitte Holden, thank you for your kind support throughout the whole project. Professor Phil Triadafilopoulos, whom I first met while studying in Toronto in 2016, invited me to the University of Toronto for my research stay in 2021. His comparative work on Canada and Germany inspired this thesis, and he provided helpful guidance on the project. Thank you.

I would like to thank the Polytechnic Foundation of Frankfurt am Main for providing me with a PhD scholarship, which supported me financially and allowed me to make the acquaintance of a group of amazing young scholars in

my cohort. In this group, I am particularly grateful for the friendship and camaraderie with my fellow scholarship holder Julia Beitner.

Transcription took up a lot of my time during this project, as my friends and family can attest. This is why I am also very grateful for Monika Aschauer's support, who, to my relief, took on the task of transcribing the French expert interviews. *Merci beaucoup!*

In Toronto, I would like to thank my friend Emma Gill-Alderson, who not only let me stay in her apartment in Roncey and look after her cat Cat, but also provided me with invaluable comments on part of my thesis draft. In Ottawa, I would like to thank Gina Alderson and Rick Gill, who let me stay with them during my research stay there and provided me with amazing home-cooked food by their cozy outdoor fireplace. In Montréal, I would like to thank the family of Valérie Michaud and Annie de Silva, who took me into their beautiful home on the Plateau twice while on research or conference trips to Montréal and made me crêpes with a lot of maple syrup while discussing Québécois culture and history with me.

In the last few years, I received immeasurable love and support from my friends, many of whom were also involved in the thesis editing process. I am so grateful to all of them because of their reassurance in times when I felt discouraged, for the laughter shared, for both the long phone calls as well as the small messages, for the trips taken, and not least, for the countless bottles of wine consumed. Thank you so very much to Hande Akbaba, Lidija Beganovic, Amelie Buck, Yelda Buz, Cristina Colmenares Richle, Melanie Dietz, Emma Gill-Alderson, Maija Jurkovic, Viktorija Krzelj, Sonia Kupferschmid, René Lutter, Sophie Rehberg, Johanna Schafgans Muñoz, Dominik Sosić, Elisabeth Schweiger, Quincy Stemmler, and Leila Stewart.

For some comedic relief, I would also like to express my gratitude to my cat Inti, whose relaxed snoring in the background of my vociferous typing really calmed me down. And, what the heck, thanks also to the Real Housewives franchise, which provided essential escapism in times of lockdown, illness, or academic overwhelm.

Lastly, I would like to thank my family. My brother Jonathan Alm believes in his older sister with an unwavering and sincere sense of pride. I thank him for this. My parents Eike Jander-Alm and Thomas Alm are responsible for my knack for minute and prescient planning, which is an essential skill for such a large project. Encouraging my independence early-on, they let me move to another country at age 16 to explore and learn, a crucial period in my life, which is at the root of this thesis project. Most importantly however, they instilled a sense of curiosity in me pretty much since the moment I started talking, always

encouraging me to ask questions and, saliently, to find answers. I am so grateful to them for their support and their love.

List of Abbreviations

AfD	Alternative für Deutschland	<i>Alternative for Germany</i>
BAMF	Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge	<i>Federal Office for Migration and Refugees</i>
BVGF	Bundesvertriebenen- und Flüchtlingsgesetz	<i>Federal Expellee and Refugee Law</i>
CBC	Canadian Broadcasting Corporation	
CCCC	Committee on Cooperation in Canadian Citizenship	
CESEDA	Code d'entrée et de séjourdes étrangers et des demandeurs d'asile	<i>Law on the entry and residence of foreigners and asylum seekers</i>
CHA	Comparative-Historical Analysis	
CJ	Critical Juncture	
DPs	Displaced Persons	
DM	Deutsche Mark	<i>German Mark</i>
EEC	European Economic Community	
EU	European Union	
FN	Front National	<i>National Front</i>
GDR	German Democratic Republic	
IMPIC	Immigration Policies in Comparison Index	
MIPEX	Migrant Integration Policy Index	
MP	Member of Parliament	
MPI	Multiculturalism Policy Index	
NIEAP	Non-Immigrant Employment Authorization Program	
ONAMO	Office National Algérien de la Main d'œuvre	<i>National Algerian Office of Manpower</i>
ONI	Office National de l'Immigration	<i>National Immigration Office</i>
PEGIDA	Patriotische Europäer gegen die Islamisierung des Abendlandes	<i>Patriotic Europeans against the Islamization of the Occident</i>
PM	Prime Minister	

PNPs	Provincial Nominee Programs	
RuStAG	Reichs- und Staatsangehörigkeits- gesetz	<i>Law on Imperial and State Nationality</i>
TFWs	Temporary Foreign Workers	
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics	

List of Tables and Charts

Tables:

<i>Table 3.1:</i>	Outline of the Expert Interview, Canadian Case	p. 80
<i>Table 3.2:</i>	Overview of Expert Interviews, Canadian Case	p. 84
<i>Table 3.3:</i>	Overview of Expert Interviews, French Case	p. 86
<i>Table 3.4:</i>	Overview of Expert Interviews, German Case	p. 87
<i>Table 4.1:</i>	Global Migration in total and in percentage of the world population since 1970	p. 97
<i>Table 4.2:</i>	Total MPI scores out of eight by country and year, 1980–2020	p. 108
<i>Table 4.3:</i>	Scores of the Top 20 countries evaluated in the MIPEX, 2020	p. 110
<i>Table 5.1:</i>	Canada – ‘The Canadian Citizenship Juncture’, 1945–1953	p. 140
<i>Table 5.2:</i>	France – ‘The Third Republic Return Juncture’, 1945–1950	p. 153
<i>Table 5.3:</i>	Germany – The Co-Ethnic Immigration Juncture, 1949–1953	p. 167
<i>Table 6.1:</i>	Canada – ‘The Points System and Multiculturalism Juncture’, 1967–1982	p. 185
<i>Table 6.2:</i>	France – The Far-Right Cleavage Juncture, 1981–1988	p. 203
<i>Table 6.3:</i>	Germany – The Transformation Juncture, 1990–2000	p. 223
<i>Table 7.1:</i>	Canada – The Period of the Harper Years, 2006–2015	p. 243
<i>Table 7.2:</i>	France – The Period of the Sarkozy Years, 2002–2012	p. 261
<i>Table 7.3:</i>	Germany – The Entrenchment Years, 2006–2020	p. 276
<i>Table 8.1:</i>	The Nexus across Time and Cases	p. 314

Charts:

<i>Chart 4.1:</i>	Percentage of Migrants in largest Immigration Countries	p. 99
<i>Chart 4.2:</i>	Total number of Migrants in Canada, France, and Germany since 1960	p. 100
<i>Chart 4.3:</i>	Percentage of migrants as part of the total population in Canada, France, and Germany since 1960	p. 101
<i>Chart 4.4:</i>	Number of naturalisations in Canada, France, and Germany, 2012-2021	p. 102
<i>Chart 4.5:</i>	Development of IMPIC score in Canada, France, and Germany, 1980-2010	p. 111

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	vii
List of Abbreviations	xi
List of Tables and Charts	xiii
I. Foundations	1
1. Introduction: On the Comparative Politics of Migration.....	3
1.1 Research Question/s	7
1.2 Research Design.....	10
1.2.1 On Research Strategy: Comparative-Historical Analysis and the Identification of Critical Junctures	10
1.2.2 On Units of Analysis: States and Politics.....	12
1.2.3 On the Case for my Cases: The Selection of Major Immigration Countries	14
1.3 Structure and Line of Approach.....	17
2. Understanding Immigration, Citizenship, and Integration: Theories and Conceptualizations of Core Concepts.....	19
2.1 On Immigration Politics.....	19
2.1.1 An Overview of Migration Theory	21
2.1.2 Theories on Immigration and the State	24
2.2.3 Conceptualizing Immigration Politics.....	29
2.2 On Citizenship Politics.....	30
2.2.1 An Overview of Citizenship Theory	31
2.2.2 Theories on Citizenship and the State	36
2.2.3 Conceptualizing Citizenship Politics.....	42
2.3 On Integration Politics	43
2.3.1 An Overview of Social Cohesion and Integration Theories.....	44
2.3.2 Theories on Immigrant Integration and the State	48

2.3.3 Conceptualizing Integration Politics	50
2.4 The Nexus between Immigration, Citizenship, and Integration Politics.....	51
2.4.1 Conceptualizing the Nexus between Immigration, Citizenship, and Integration Politics	53
2.4.2 The Immigration, Citizenship, and Integration Nexus as an Analytical Tool in Comparative-Historical Research.....	55
3. Methodology: On Comparison, Comparative-Historical Analysis and Expert Interviews	57
3.1 Research Approach: On Comparison in Political Science and Migration Research	58
3.1.1 Why we compare: On Comparative Logics and Epistemic Tensions.....	58
3.1.2 How we compare: On the Selection of Cases and Comparative Strategies	61
3.1.3 ‘Bringing the State back in’: On the State as a Unit of Analysis in Migration Research.....	63
3.2 Comparative-Historical Analysis: Situating this Project within the Research Paradigm.....	65
3.2.1 What is Comparative-Historical Analysis?	66
3.2.2 Time in Comparative-Historical Analysis: Taking History Seriously	68
3.2.3 The Application of Comparative-Historical Analysis in this Research Project: Critical Junctures	69
3.3 Empirical Analysis: Secondary Literature Analysis and Expert Interviews.....	72
3.3.1 Secondary Literature Analysis	72
3.3.2 Expert Interviews: On the Use of Narrative Accounts for this Research Project	73
3.4 Interim Conclusion: CHA, Critical Junctures, and Expert Interviews.....	90
4. State of the Art: Contributions and Gaps in Comparative Migration Research on Canada, France, and Germany	93
4.1 An Overview of Migration History and Politics	94

4.1.1 Historical Phases of Global Migration Movements	94
4.1.2 Statistical Data on Migration Politics in Canada, France, and Germany	98
4.2 Comparative Analyses of Migration Politics	102
4.2.1 Typologies, Categorizations and Indices of the Country Cases based on their Migration Politics	102
4.2.2 Research in Comparative-Historical Analysis on Migration Politics	112
4.3 Interim Conclusion: Contributions and Gaps in the Literature	117
 II: Analysis: The Historical Trajectories of Politics of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ in Canada, France, and Germany	 125
 5. Manifesting Unity, Belonging, and Exclusion: Migration Politics in the Postwar Years	 129
5.1 Introduction.....	129
5.2 Canada – Becoming Canadian, 1945–1952	130
5.2.1 Pre-History: Creating white European Canada	130
5.2.2 Manifesting a new Canadian Self-Conception through Citizenship.....	134
5.2.3 Canada becomes Canadian.....	140
5.2 France – Making a Comeback, 1945–1950.....	141
5.3.1 Pre-History: Demographic Struggles and the Establishment of Europe’s Oldest Immigration Country	141
5.3.2 The Return of a Durable Immigration Country, 1945–1950	144
5.3.3 Colonial Entanglements in Postwar Immigration and Citizenship Politics	147
5.3.4 Postwar French Integration Politics and the Question of Demographic Preference	150
5.3.5 Framing 1945–1950 as a Critical Juncture in French Migration Politics	152
5.4 Germany – Establishing a Co-Ethnic Immigration Country, 1948–1953.....	154
5.4.1 Pre-History: German Historical Resistance to Diversification...	154
5.4.2 The ‘Multiple Meanings’ of 1945	158

5.4.3 ‘A new “Us”’? Citizenship and Integration Politics in the Newly Established Germany	161
5.4.4 Framing the postwar Critical Juncture for German Migration Politics, 1945–1953	165
5.5 Interim Conclusion: The Politics of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ in the Postwar Era	168
 6. ‘Who are we? Who do we want to be?’: Mid- to late 20th Century Migration Politics in Canada, France, and Germany	171
6.1 Introduction.....	171
6.2 Canada – Paradigmatic Transitions to Establish Cohesive Migration Politics, 1962–1988.....	172
6.2.1 No more race, no more religion, 1952–1962.....	173
6.2.2 The Emergence of the Points System and Multiculturalism as a State Doctrine, 1963–1988	177
6.2.3 Understanding the shifting Immigration, Citizenship, and Integration Politics Nexus, 1967–1982	183
6.3 France – From ‘Open Door’ to Zero Immigration, 1981–1988	186
6.3.1 Migration Politics and Colonial Entanglements, 1953–1973	187
6.3.2 Migration Politics in Turmoil, 1974–1980.....	191
6.3.3 The Politicization of French Migration Politics, 1981–1988	194
6.3.4 The Foundational Years: Making Sense of French Immigration, Citizenship, and Integration Politics, 1980–1988	201
6.4 Germany – The Transformational Decade, 1989–2000	204
6.4.1 Becoming a ‘de-facto immigration country’, 1955–1988	205
6.4.2 ‘A painful process of acknowledgment’: Migration Politics in Post-Unification Germany, 1989–2000	210
6.4.3 The Legacy of Post-Unification Migration Politics, 2000–2005	220
6.4.4 Learning from the Migration Politics of the Post-Unification Decade	221
6.5 Interim Conclusion: The Politics of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ in the mid- to late 20th Century	224

7. Moving forward, Remaining the Same: Migration Politics in Canada, France, and Germany in the New Millennium	225
7.1 Introduction.....	225
7.2 Canada – The Harper Years challenge the Status Quo, 2006–2015.....	226
7.2.1 Migration Politics in the 1990s and early 2000s	227
7.2.2 ‘A rude awakening’ – The Harper Years, 2006–2015.....	229
7.2.3 Migration Politics Take Centre Stage – The 2015 Election Campaign.....	236
7.2.4 The Harper Effect on the Migration Politics Nexus, 2015–2020	240
7.3 France – ‘Plus ça change?’ Migration Politics in the Sarkozy Era, 2002–2012.....	244
7.3.1 Migration Politics under Conservative Reign, 1995–2004	244
7.3.2 ‘A past that does not pass.’ – 2005.....	248
7.3.3 After 2005 – Sarkozy, the ‘pyromaniac’ of migration politics?	254
7.3.4 Whither a Sarkozyist Approach? – Migration Politics in France, 2012–2020	258
7.4 Germany – Becoming the Most Important European Immigration Country, 2006–2020.....	263
7.4.1 How to be an Immigration Country – Institutionalizing Migration Politics, 2006–2014	263
7.4.2 ‘Germany, of all countries’ – 2015	267
7.4.3 Normalizing Migration Politics, 2006–2020.....	271
7.5 Interim Conclusion: The Politics of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ in the New Millennium.....	276
III. Comparative Results	279
8. Dynamic Typologies of the Migration Politics Nexus in Canada, France, and Germany.....	280
8.1 Critical Junctures and Migration Politics.....	280
8.1.1 Critical Junctures for the Migration Politics Nexus in Canada	281

8.1.2 Critical Junctures for the Migration Politics Nexus in France	285
8.1.3 Critical Junctures for the Migration Politics Nexus in Germany	289
8.1.4 Methodological Insights for Critical Junctures from this Research Project.....	294
8.2 Comparative Insights on Canada, France, and Germany by Period.....	296
8.2.1 Comparing the Migration Politics Nexus before the End of World War II.....	296
8.2.2 Comparing the Migration Politics Nexus in the Postwar Years	299
8.2.3 Comparing the Migration Politics Nexus in the mid- to late 20th Century	303
8.2.4 Comparing the Migration Politics Nexus in the early 21st Century.....	308
8.3 Interactive Dynamics in the Migration Politics Nexus	312
9. Conclusion – A New Perspective on the Politics of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’	316
9.1 Looking Back: Central Arguments, Research Design, and Challenges.....	317
9.2 Central Research Question: Answers and Main Insights	321
9.3 Looking Forward: The Future Politics of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’	329
References.....	333
Appendix.....	361
I. Guides to the partially structured Expert Interviews.....	361
II. Tabular Illustration of Critical Junctures	368
III. Excursus: The Interconnection between Migration Politics and Indigenous Politics in Canada	376
IV. Excursus: Research Cultures on Migration Politics in Canada, France, and Germany	378
Index.....	385